

**POST COMPLETION REVIEW LESSONS LEARNED**

---

**1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

- 1.1 As part of the programme of continuous improvement the Strategic Asset Management Board carries out post completion reviews of capital projects to look for good practice which can be replicated across project delivery as well as aspects of delivery which could be improved.
- 1.2 This report summarises the findings and lessons learned from carrying out reviews of capital projects which completed during 2014-15.

---

**POST COMPLETION REVIEWS AND LESSONS LEARNED**

---

**2. INTRODUCTION**

2.1 As part of the programme of continuous improvement the Strategic Asset Management Board carries out post completion reviews of capital projects to:

- Identify good practice
- Identify areas for improvement

2.2 The purpose of this report set out the learning points identified by the reviews.

**3. RECOMMENDATIONS**

3.1 To note the contents of the report.

**4. DETAIL**

4.1 The Audit Scotland report on Major Capital Investment in Councils recommended that Councils carried out post completion reviews of capital projects and reported the findings in conjunction with any lessons learned.

4.2 In respect of capital projects completed during 2014-15 reviews were carried out which looked at project performance covering the following:

- Completed on time
- Completed on budget
- Contractor Performance
- Lessons Learned

4.3 In terms of asset sustainability projects these were considered at the programme level as that is how they are managed with any learning points being identified. In respect of service development and strategic change projects each project was looked at individually with a template being completed.

4.4 The key findings from the reviews undertaken were that in general projects were completed on time. There were variations between budgets and actuals at individual project level, but the overall programme, in terms of asset sustainability projects was managed to deal with these variations. The overall performance of contractors was good, but there were instances of poor performance which should be addressed when selecting the contractor and this will in the future inform the Council's Vendor Rating System.

- 4.5 The main lessons learned were that it is important to have communication, early agreement and engagement with clients. Collaborative working has been a success and areas of this type of working need to be communicated to all services. Consideration of programming a number of jobs at the same facility can lead to reductions in disruption to users of the facility and to reduced overall costs in respect of the projects. The Council purchased materials in respect of a number of jobs and this was beneficial in terms of the contract delivery.
- 4.6 In terms of areas for improvement it was identified that there needs to be clear brief of the client's requirements before proceeding with a contract. Where a number of areas of work were combined this led to benefits but added to the complexity of managing the programme of jobs. In respect of property works more detailed surveys should be considered to gain a better understanding of the work required which would assist with more accurate costing of the job.
- 4.7 Appendix 1 illustrates the nature of the findings from the review how they will be addressed while appendix 2 shows details of project performance.

## 5. CONCLUSION

- 5.1 The carrying out of the post completion reviews has highlighted a number of lessons which if implemented should result in improved performance in the delivery of future capital projects.

## 6. IMPLICATIONS

- |     |                    |  |
|-----|--------------------|--|
| 6.1 | Policy –           | None   |
| 6.2 | Financial -        | None   |
| 6.3 | Legal -            | None.  |
| 6.4 | HR -               | None   |
| 6.5 | Equalities -       | None.  |
| 6.6 | Risk -             | By applying the lessons learned this should reduce the risks associated with delivery of capital projects in the future. |
| 6.7 | Customer Service - | None.  |

### **Malcolm MacFadyen, Head of Facility Services**

For further information please contact:

Peter Cupples, Finance Manager – Corporate Support 01546-604183

Appendix 1 Project Findings  
Appendix 2 Project Performance



## Appendix 1 Project Findings

<b>Project</b>	<b>Findings</b>	<b>Responsible Officer</b>
Traffic Management	To enable improved co-ordination of works programme, list of works should be compiled much earlier in the year than has been the custom in the past.	Head of Roads and Amenity Services
Bridge Strengthening	External consultants used to progress some schemes due to lack of internal staff availability. Longer term financial planning is required to make best use of the budgets allocated and to address the risks of sub strength structures.	Head of Roads and Amenity Services
Flood Prevention	Consider turfing rather than seeding in residential areas.	Head of Roads and Amenity Services
Street Lighting	Daily assessments of sites, paid dividends in works completed	Head of Roads and Amenity Services
Zero Waste Fund	Smart purchasing and invoices paid on time resulted in savings	Head of Roads and Amenity Services
Argyll House Heating & Lighting Upgrade	Council supply of materials should be considered where this could be beneficial to the delivery of the project.	Head of Facility Services
Argyll House, Dunoon	Detailed survey/assessment of necessary works would have been beneficial in setting budget.	Head of Facility Services
Whitegates Offices, Lochgilphead - Roofing Improvements	Prior investigative tests to roof structure will reduce possibility of unknown costs	Head of Facility Services

Gaelic Centre - Corran Halls	Snag the job as they proceed rather than on completion.	Head of Facility Services
Tayvallich Primary School - Pre 5 Unit	Experienced site supervision required from commencement of contract	Head of Facility Services
Manse Brae, (Roads) -Mid Argyll Office Reorganisation	Endeavour to let contracts well before programmed start date.	Head of Facility Services
Schools refurbishment projects (General)	Ensure school are aware of extent of work and cleaning time required at end of contract	Head of Facility Services
Hermitage Primary School Extension	Contractor worked well with school after initial noise and disturbance complaints. Managing schools expectations while contractors on site.	Head of Facility Services

## Appendix 2 Project Performance

Project Description	Cost				Completed		
	Budget	Actual	Variance	Variance	On Time	Within Budget	Within Scope
	£000's	£000's	£000's	%	Y/N	Y/N	Y/N
Roads Reconstruction	6,697	7,718	-1,021	-15.25%	Y	N	N
Traffic Management	85	103	-18	-21.18%	Y	N	Y
Environmental - Rose Garden	34	33	1	2.94%	Y	Y	Y
Bridge Strengthening	280	334	-54	-19.29%	Y	N	Y
Flood Prevention	60	55	5	8.33%	Y	Y	Y
Street Lighting	507	565	-58	-11.44%	Y	N	Y
Zero Waste Fund	34	24	10	29.41%	y	Y	y
Gartbreck Waste Disposal Site	64	57	7	10.94%	y	Y	y
Municipal Buildings Oban - Creation of Service Point	127	127	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Municipal Buildings, Albany St, Oban - Workforce Deployment	72	72	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Lorn House, Oban	45	30	15	33.33%	Y	Y	Y
Rothesay Swimming Pool	339	339	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Argyll House Heating & Lighting Upgrade	48	49	-1	-2.08%	Y	N	Y
SW Office Lorn Resource Centre - Oban Office Rationalisation	57	57	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Lorn House - Oban Office Rationalisation Implementation	71	71	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Union Street, Rothesay	75	75	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Dalriada House, Lochgilphead	8	8	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Castle House, Dunoon	17	16	1	5.88%	Y	Y	Y
Manse Brae District Office, Lochgilphead	15	36	-21	-140.00%	Y	N	N
Argyll House, Dunoon	46	13	33	71.74%	Y	Y	Y
Blairvadach	20	2	18	90.00%	Y	Y	Y
Whitegates Offices, Lochgilphead - Roofing Improvements	112	202	-90	-80.36%	N	N	Y
Thomson Home - Health & Safety	16	16	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Health & Safety - Eadar Glinn Baths	29	29	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Tigh a Rhuda Care Home - Health & Safety	7	7	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Ardfenaig Care Home - Health & Safety	39	39	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Health & Safety - Woodlands Resource Centre	6	6	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y

Project Description	Cost				Completed		
	Budget	Actual	Variance	Variance	On Time	Within Budget	Within Scope
Eadar Glinn - Health & Safety	31	31	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Lismore Primary School - Drainage Works	61	6	55	90.16%	Y	Y	Y
Woodlands/Greenwood - Services Upgrade	111	34	77	69.37%	Y	Y	Y
Gaelic Centre - Corran Halls	170	173	-3	-1.76%	Y	N	Y
Gaelic Media Studio - Oban High School	91	53	38	41.76%	Y	Y	Y
St Andrews Primary School - Capital Property Works	3	3	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Rhunahaorine Primary School - Capital Property Works	10	10	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Dunoon Primary School House - Secondary Glazing	51	51	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Kilninver Primary School - Roofing Works	25	25	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Port Ellen Primary School Kitchen	29	29	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Garelochhead Primary School Staging	7	7	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Tayvallich Primary School - Pre 5 Unit	430	438	-8	-1.86%	Y	N	Y
Video Conferencing Upgrade - Secondary Schools	60	55	5	8.33%	Y	Y	Y
Victoria Hall, Helensburgh - Fire Alarm Upgrade	282	35	247	87.59%	Y	Y	Y
Ramsey Memorial Hall - Water Heating	185	14	171	92.43%	Y	Y	Y
Manse Brae (Roads) -Mid Argyll Office Reorganisation	242	346	-104	-42.98%	Y	N	Y
Tarbert Academy - Mid Argyll Office Re Organisation	20	20	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Kintyre Community Education Centre - DDA Entrance	25	25	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Tarbert Library - Health & Safety	15	15	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Garelochhead Primary School - Capital Property Works	15	15	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Port Charlotte Primary School - Capital Property Works	30	30	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
John Logie Baird Primary School Doors - Capital Property Works	9	9	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Tobermory High School - Capital Property Works	50	50	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Park Primary School - Capital Property Works	77	77	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Glencruitten Hostel, Oban - Health & Safety	6	6	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Glencruitten Hostel - Health & Safety	17	17	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Keills Schoolhouse - Housing Quality Standard	32	32	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Port Charlotte School House - Housing Quality Standard	38	38	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Balemartine New School House - Housing Quality Standard	20	20	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Tarbert Academy - Early Learning and Childcare - Pre 5 Unit	165	165	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y



Project Description	Cost				Completed		
	Budget	Actual	Variance	Variance	On Time	Within Budget	Within Scope
Bowmore Primary School - Early Learning & Childcare - Pre 5 Unit	106	106	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Bunessan Primary School - Early Learning & Childcare - Pre 5 Unit	81	81	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Free School Meals - Kitchen Upgrade - Dalintober Primary School	25	25	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Asbestos Education - Cardross Primary School	38	38	0	0.00%	Y	Y	Y
Asbestos Education - Strone Primary School	85	2	83	97.65%	Y	Y	Y
Kintyre Renewables Hub	12,115	11,571	544	4.49%	N	Y	Y
Hermitage Primary School Extension	765	823	-58	-7.58%	Y	N	Y
Carbon Management	261	202	59	22.61%	Y	Y	Y
Carbon Management Fuel Conversion	145	107	38	26.21%	Y	Y	Y
Solar Panels	488	379	109	22.34%	Y	Y	Y
Oil to Gas Conversions	209	182	27	12.92%	Y	Y	Y